PROCEEDINGS OF THE INTERNATIONAL CONFERENCE ON
THEOLOGY, RELIGION, CULTURE, AND HUMANITIES
Vol. 3, No. 1, June 2026 (252-264)

Becoming a Whole Human Being in the Liquid Age from the Perspective of the Spirituality of the Precious Blood

Maria Theodora Dhone [a,1]
Carolus Borromeus Mulyatno [b]
[a,b] *Faculty of Theology, Sanata Dharma University, Indonesia*

[1]Corresponding Email: theodoradone25@gmail.com
DOI: https://doi.org/10.24071/tic.v3i1.934

Abstract

The condition of liquid modernity, as proposed by Zygmunt Bauman, represents a fundamental transformation in the social order characterized by fluidity, uncertainty, and the erosion of previously relatively stable value structures. This dynamic not only impacts institutional change but also triggers an ontological crisis in humans, particularly in terms of identity, the meaning of existence, and ethical relations with others. In this context, individuals are at risk of being reduced to functional entities vulnerable to dehumanization, even marginalized as "human scum" due to the dominance of instrumental rationality and extreme individualism. This research aims to critically examine the efforts to become fully human amidst the complexity of the liquid era, by placing moral responsibility towards others (the Other) as the core of reflection through the perspective of the Spirituality of the Noble Blood. The urgency of this research stems from the strengthening symptoms of social disintegration and weakening ethical awareness in contemporary society, where individual freedom is no longer balanced by moral commitment to others. This situation demands a reflective-critical approach that not only describes reality but also reconstructs the ethical horizon of humanity. This study uses a qualitative approach with a comparative-philosophical method, which examines Bauman's thoughts on liquid modernity and articulates them in a critical dialogue with the values of the Spirituality of the Noble Blood. The analysis is carried out through conceptual interpretation and dialectical reflection on the relationship between individual freedom and unlimited moral responsibility towards the Other. The results of the study show that human integrity cannot be reduced to normative compliance or the stability of a false identity, but rather lies in the existential courage to affirm moral responsibility radically. The Spirituality of the Noble Blood functions as an ethical-transformative framework that affirms that true humanity is realized through the praxis of empathy, solidarity, and commitment to collective hope. This study contributes to expanding the discourse of social philosophy by offering a critical synthesis between the analysis of liquid modernity and spirituality as an ethical foundation in building a more dignified life.

This work is licensed under CC BY-SA 4.0

Keywords

Liquid modernity, whole human being, moral responsibility, spirituality, dehumanization

INTRODUCTION

The development of contemporary society shows increasingly dynamic, flexible, and uncertain changes. This condition is often understood as a key characteristic of advanced modernity, which Zygmunt Bauman calls *liquid modernity*. In this context, previously relatively stable social structures undergo a transformation into more fluid ones, so that values, norms, and social relations no longer possess solid certainty. These changes place individuals in a situation full of uncertainty, where identity and the meaning of life must be continuously renegotiated. The implication of this condition is the emergence of significant existential pressure for humans. Individuals are not only required to adapt quickly but also must be able to maintain their existence in an increasingly competitive social system. In this situation, humans are often reduced to functional entities assessed based on their productivity and contribution to the system. As a result, those who are unable to keep up with the flow of change are potentially socially marginalized, which can ultimately lead to dehumanization.

This phenomenon demonstrates that fluid modernity not only produces progress but also presents a profound humanitarian crisis. Social relations previously based on solidarity now tend to shift toward instrumental ones. Within this framework, the existence of the "Other" is no longer understood as a subject possessing intrinsic dignity, but rather as an object judged based on particular interests1. This indicates a weakening of moral responsibility in social life, which should be the primary foundation of human relations. This crisis emphasizes the importance of rethinking the meaning of being fully human. Human integrity cannot be reduced solely to rational or social aspects, but must encompass ethical and spiritual dimensions. In situations of uncertainty, human integrity is tested by one's ability to adhere to humanitarian values and moral responsibility towards others.

In this context, the Spirituality of the Precious Blood offers a relevant perspective to address these challenges. This spirituality emphasizes the values of sacrifice, love, and boundless responsibility for others as the core of human life. This approach positions humans not merely as autonomous individuals, but as relational

[1] Bauman, Zygmunt. *Liquid Modernity*. Cambridge: Polity Press, 2000.

subjects whose existence is always connected to others[2]. Thus, human wholeness is understood as the ability to foster meaningful relationships with others, especially those in vulnerable positions. Generally, this approach aligns with critiques of modern ethics that overemphasize formal rules. In various studies, morality in modern society is no longer understood as adherence to rigid norms, but rather as a direct and non-transferable personal responsibility[3]. in this regard, responsibility for the Other becomes central to ethical reflection, so that human wholeness is determined not by adherence to the system, but by the courage to be present for others. Furthermore, current social conditions demonstrate a tendency toward increasing individualism and declining social solidarity. The instability of the social order not only creates uncertainty but also increases the risk of social exclusion and dehumanization. Therefore, an approach is needed that is not only analytical, but also transformative, which is capable of returning human orientation to fundamental human values.

This research stems from the awareness of the importance of reexamining the concept of human wholeness amidst the challenges of fluid modernity. Specifically, this research aims to analyze how humans can become whole through experiencing moral responsibility towards the Other. Using a qualitative approach and comparative philosophical methods, this research connects the sociological perspective on fluid modernity with the values of the Spirituality of the Noble Blood. Through this approach, this research is expected to produce an understanding that human wholeness lies not in adherence to formal rules, but in the courage to shoulder unlimited moral responsibility towards others. This wholeness is also related to the ability to maintain hope for a more dignified life together. Thus, humans are not only individuals who survive in uncertain conditions, but also become subjects capable of bringing meaning to their lives. The contribution of this research lies in the effort to integrate sociological and spiritual perspectives in understanding the humanitarian crisis in the modern era. This study is expected to enrich academic discourse, while also providing critical reflection on how humans can remain whole amidst the dynamics of a fluid era.

[2] Bauman, Zygmunt. *Wasted Lives: Modernity and Its Outcasts*. Cambridge: Polity Press, 2004.

[3] Fox, Nick J. "Postmodernism, Sociology and Health." *Sociology of Health & Illness* 18, no. 3 (1996): 387–404.

METHOD

This study uses a qualitative approach with a comparative philosophical approach, aiming to deeply examine the concept of human wholeness in the context of fluid modernity and relate it to the values of the Spirituality of the Noble Blood. The qualitative approach was chosen because this study focuses on understanding meaning, conceptual interpretation, and critical reflection on social and spiritual phenomena, rather than on quantitative measurement of variables[4]. Thus, this study seeks to explore the deep dimensions of human reality that cannot be reduced to numbers or statistics. Epistemologically, this study departs from an interpretive paradigm that views social reality as something dynamic and shaped through the interaction of meanings. Within this framework, humans are understood as active subjects in constructing the meaning of their lives, especially in the face of the fluid and uncertain conditions of modernity. Therefore, a philosophical approach is relevant because it allows for an analysis that is not only descriptive, but also reflective and critical of the human existential condition.

The type of research used is comparative philosophy, namely a method that compares two or more frameworks of thought to find similarities, differences, and possible synthesis between them. In this study, Zygmunt Bauman's thoughts on *liquid modernity* are used as the analytical basis in understanding social conditions that are fluid, unstable, and full of uncertainty. This perspective is then compared with the Spirituality of the Noble Blood which emphasizes unlimited moral responsibility towards others (the Other), solidarity, and sacrifice as the core of human wholeness. The research procedure is carried out through several systematic stages. First, the concept identification stage, which examines the main concepts in the theory of liquid modernity, such as uncertainty, individualization, identity flexibility, and social exclusion. Second, the value exploration stage, which explores fundamental values in the Spirituality of the Noble Blood, such as love, sacrifice, and ethical responsibility towards others. Third, the comparative analysis stage, which compares the two perspectives to find common ground and fundamental differences. Fourth, the conceptual synthesis stage, which formulates a new understanding of human wholeness relevant to the context of liquid modernity.

[4] Schneiders, Sandra M. "Religion vs. Spirituality: A Contemporary Conundrum." *Spiritus* 3, no. 2 (2003): 163–185.

The data sources in this study are secondary data obtained from scientific journal articles, particularly those related to the study of modernity, ethics, and spirituality. Source selection was carried out purposively, taking into account topic relevance, academic credibility, and contributions to the development of the researched concept. Thus, the literature used serves not only as a reference but also as material for in-depth analysis. Data collection techniques were carried out through library research, namely by identifying, critically reading, and categorizing relevant literature. This process involves recording key concepts, grouping themes, and exploring relationships between ideas. In this stage, the researcher not only collects data but also conducts an initial interpretation of the meaning contained in each source.

Data analysis was conducted using two main approaches: content analysis and interpretive analysis. Content analysis was used to identify patterns, themes, and key concepts in the reviewed literature, while interpretive analysis was used to understand the deeper meaning of these concepts and relate them to the research context[7]. The analysis process was carried out iteratively and in-depth to ensure that the resulting interpretations were consistent and comprehensive. To ensure data validity, this study employed source triangulation techniques, namely by comparing various journal references related to the research topic. Furthermore, the researcher also conducted critical reflection on each source to avoid interpretation bias. The validity of the study was maintained through consistency between the data, analysis, and conclusions.

By using a comparative philosophical approach, this research not only describes the conditions of fluid modernity but also offers normative reflections on how humans can achieve their wholeness. This approach allows for the integration of sociological analysis and spiritual values, resulting in a more comprehensive understanding of humans as beings who are not only rational but also ethical and spiritual.

RESULT

Humanitarian Crisis in Liquid Modernity

Social change in contemporary society shows a tendency toward increasing fluidity, flexibility, and instability. Zygmunt Bauman defines this condition as *liquid modernity* , a phase in which social structures no longer have a fixed form and tend to

undergo continuous dissolution[5]. In this situation, humans no longer live in a system that provides certainty, but rather in a social space filled with ambiguity and rapid change. As a result, individuals are required to continuously adapt without a solid foundation for determining their life's direction. One of the main impacts of this condition is increasing existential uncertainty. Uncertainty occurs not only in the economic or work spheres, but also extends to the dimensions of identity and social relations. Individuals experience difficulty in establishing a stable identity due to the demands of constant flexibility and adaptation. This gives rise to ongoing anxiety and insecurity in daily life[6].

Furthermore, liquid modernity is also characterized by the strengthening of individualization. Individuals are positioned as primary actors fully responsible for their lives, yet at the same time, they exist within a competitive and uncertain system. The freedom they possess becomes a burden because it is not accompanied by guarantees of social stability.[7]In this context, social relations shift from those based on solidarity to those based on instrumental and pragmatic principles. A further impact of this condition is the emergence of social exclusion. Modern systems that emphasize efficiency and productivity tend to exclude individuals who cannot meet established standards. Those who are unproductive or uncompetitive are deemed irrelevant and lose their place in the social structure. This phenomenon indicates a process of dehumanization, where humans are valued solely based on their function and usefulness. To clarify this tendency, the following is a synthesis of several journal studies relevant to the theme of liquid modernity and the humanitarian crisis:

Table 1. Synthesis of Studies on Liquid Modernity and the Humanitarian Crisis

No	Author & Year	Focus of Study	Key Findings	Relevance
1	Scribano (2013)	Body and emotion in liquid modernity	Social instability affects human identity and relationships	Explaining the identity crisis
2	Fox (1996)	Postmodernism and social relations	Social fragmentation weakens social ties	Demonstrate individualization

[5] Bauman, Zygmunt. "The Individualized Society and Its Discontents." *Thesis Eleven* 54, no. 1 (1998): 1–9.

[6] Scribano, Adrian. "Sociology of Bodies/Emotions and Liquid Modernity." Current Sociology 61, no. 5–6 (2013): 1–10.

[7] Fox, Nick J. "Postmodernism, Sociology and Health." *Sociology of Health & Illness* 18, no. 3 (1996): 387–404.

3	Bauman (1998)	Individualized society	Freedom without certainty increases social anxiety	Main theoretical basis
4	Delanty (2000)	Modernity and globalization	Rapid change creates global uncertainty	The context of social change
5	Cimperman (2013)	Spirituality of solidarity	Emphasizes the importance of relationships and responsibilities	Contrast to the crisis

Based on this table, it can be understood that fluid modernity not only impacts changes in social structures, but also on the existential dimension of human beings. Scribano emphasizes that social instability directly impacts the human body and emotions, making identity fragile and changeable.[8] Meanwhile, Fox points out that social fragmentation in modern society leads to weakened social ties, resulting in increasing isolation of individuals.[9]

Bauman himself asserts that modern society is characterized by high individualization, where individuals have extensive freedom but without guarantees of certainty. This condition creates a paradox: freedom that actually breeds anxiety. On the other hand, Delanty sees globalization accelerating social change, making uncertainty a key feature of modern life.[10] Generally, Cimperman offers a different perspective by emphasizing the importance of solidarity as a response to the crisis.[11]This shows that amidst the individualistic tendencies of liquid modernity, there is still an opportunity to rebuild more humane social relations. Thus, the humanitarian crisis in liquid modernity can be understood as the result of a combination of uncertainty, individualization, and social exclusion. Humans are no longer viewed as subjects with intrinsic dignity, but rather as objects valued based on their usefulness. This condition leads to the emergence of the phenomenon of "human waste," namely individuals who are considered to have no value in the social system.

This situation demonstrates that fluid modernity presents not only structural challenges but also a profound moral crisis. Therefore, an approach is needed that can

[8] Swinton, John. "Spirituality and Mental Health Care." *Journal of Clinical Nursing* 10, no. 6 (2001): 760–766.

[9] Principe, Walter H. "Toward Defining Spirituality." *Studies in Religion* 12, no. 2 (1983): 127–141.

[10] Delanty, Gerard. "Modernity and Postmodernity: Knowledge, Power and the Self." *European Journal of Social Theory* 3, no. 2 (2000): 1–15.

[11] Cimperman, Maria. "The Spirituality of Solidarity." *Theological Studies* 74, no. 2 (2013): 280–303.

restore humans to their essential humanity, namely as beings with responsibilities to others. This reflection is crucial as a foundation for understanding how humans can remain whole amidst uncertain conditions.

Deconstruction of Human Integrity from Compliance to Moral Responsibility

In the context of fluid modernity, the concept of human wholeness undergoes a significant shift. While within the framework of classical modernity, human wholeness is often associated with adherence to established norms, rules, and social structures, in fluid societies, this concept becomes increasingly problematic. When social structures lose their stability, adherence to rules is no longer sufficient to guarantee human wholeness. In fact, in situations full of uncertainty, humans are required to find a deeper ethical basis in determining their actions. Zygmunt Bauman's thinking shows that ethics in modern society can no longer be reduced to a system of universal and rigid rules. In fluid realities, rules are often unable to address the complexity of moral situations faced by individuals. Therefore, human wholeness cannot be measured by the extent to which a person adheres to norms, but rather by how he or she is able to take personal responsibility in relationships with others.

Within this framework, a need arises to deconstruct the old understanding of human wholeness. This deconstruction does not mean rejecting norms altogether, but rather shifting the focus from external obedience to internal responsibility. Humans are no longer understood as subjects who simply follow rules, but as moral agents who actively determine their attitudes toward others, especially toward the "Other." The concept of the Other in ethical philosophy emphasizes that the existence of others cannot be reduced to objects within a social system. Instead, the Other exists as a subject demanding unlimited moral responsibility. In this perspective, relationships with others are not transactional reciprocity, but rather ethical relationships that demand openness and recognition of human dignity.[12]

However, in fluid modernity, this kind of relationship is actually eroding. Strong individualization causes individuals to focus more on their own interests, weakening their sense of responsibility to others. Social relations tend to be temporary and superficial, preventing the development of deep moral responsibility. This situation suggests that the humanitarian crisis is occurring not only at the structural level but also at the ethical level. To understand this shift more systematically, the following is a synthesis of journal studies related to ethical transformation in modern society:

[12] Bauman, Zygmunt. "Postmodern Ethics." *Theory, Culture & Society* 10, no. 1 (1993): 1–18.

Table 2. Deconstruction of Ethics in Liquid Modernity

No	Author & Year	Focus of Study	Key Findings	Relevance
1	Bauman (1993/1998)	Postmodern ethics	Morality is based on responsibility, not rules.	The basis of ethical deconstruction
2	Levinas (adaptation of ethical studies)	Ethics of Others	Responsibility for others is limitless	The foundation of the concept of Liyan
3	Biesta (2010)	Education and responsibility	Ethical subjects are formed through relations with others.	Strengthening relationality
4	Barnett (2004)	Modern uncertainty	The supercomplex world demands individual ethical reflection.	The context of modernity
5	Delanty (2000)	Reflexive modernity	Identity is formed through social reflection	Supporting changes in human concepts

Based on the table, it is clear that there has been a shift in the ethical paradigm from rule-based to responsibility-based. Bauman emphasizes that in postmodern society, morality cannot be left to systems or institutions, but must be lived out personally by individuals.[13] This shows that human wholeness no longer depends on obedience, but on active moral awareness. Levinas , through the concept of the ethics of the Other, provides a strong philosophical foundation for this understanding. He emphasizes that responsibility towards others is primary and non- negotiable.[14] Thus, human wholeness lies precisely in the ability to respond ethically to the presence of others.

Furthermore, Biesta shows that the human subject is formed through relationships with others, so that responsibility is not something additional, but rather the essence of human existence.[15] Barnett adds that in a super-complex world, individuals are required to have reflective capacity to be able to make ethical

[13] Levinas, Emmanuel. "Ethics as First Philosophy." Dalam *The Levinas Reader*. Oxford: Blackwell, 1989.

[14] Biesta, Gert. "Good Education in an Age of Measurement." *Educational Assessment, Evaluation and Accountability* 21, no. 1 (2010): 33–46.

[15] Barnett, Ronald. "Learning for an Unknown Future." *Higher Education Research & Development* 23, no. 3 (2004): 247–260.

decisions amidst uncertainty.[16] Meanwhile, Delanty emphasizes that human identity in modernity is formed through a continuous process of social reflection.[17] Thus, the deconstruction of human wholeness from obedience to moral responsibility shows that the essence of humanity lies in ethical relationships with others. Human wholeness is no longer determined by conformity to norms, but by the courage to take responsibility without guarantees of certainty. In the context of fluid modernity, this becomes very important because only through moral responsibility can humans maintain their humanity amidst conditions of uncertainty.

The Spirituality of the Precious Blood as an Ethical-Transformative Path

In the midst of a humanitarian crisis marked by uncertainty, individualization, and a weakening of moral responsibility, an approach that is not only analytical but also transformative is needed. It is at this point that the Spirituality of the Precious Blood becomes relevant as an ethical path capable of responding to the challenges of fluid modernity. While the previous subsection demonstrated that human integrity can no longer rest on adherence to rules, the Spirituality of the Precious Blood offers an alternative basis in the form of moral responsibility rooted in love, sacrifice, and solidarity. The Spirituality of the Precious Blood views humans as relational beings whose existence cannot be separated from others. In this perspective, human integrity is not found solely in individual autonomy, but rather in active involvement in the lives of others, especially those who are vulnerable and marginalized. This approach directly challenges the logic of fluid modernity, which tends to place humans in instrumental and pragmatic relationships.

The primary value of the Spirituality of the Precious Blood is sacrifice as the highest form of moral responsibility. Sacrifice here is not understood as loss, but rather as an ethical act that affirms one's humanity. In this context, humans find their wholeness when they are able to transcend personal interests and be present for others. This demonstrates that human wholeness is relational and inseparable from responsibility for the Other. Furthermore, the Spirituality of the Precious Blood also emphasizes the importance of love as the foundation of human relationships. Love is not merely understood as an emotion, but as an ethical commitment to respect and maintain human dignity. In a fluid modern situation full of uncertainty, love becomes a force capable of maintaining the sustainability of social relations and preventing dehumanization. To strengthen this analysis, the following is a synthesis of several journal studies relevant to spirituality, ethics, and social transformation:

[16] Delanty, Gerard. "Modernity and Postmodernity: Knowledge, Power and the Self." *European Journal of Social Theory* 3, no. 2 (2000): 1–15.

[17] Cimperman, Maria. "The Spirituality of Solidarity." *Theological Studies* 74, no. 2 (2013): 280–303.

Table 3. Spirituality and Ethical Transformation

No	Author & Year	Focus of Study	Key Findings	Relevance
1	Cimperman (2013)	Spirituality of solidarity	Solidarity as a form of moral responsibility	In line with the Precious Blood
2	Schneiders (2003)	Christian Spirituality	Spirituality as life transformation	Spiritual basis
3	Waaijman (2002/2006)	Study of spirituality	Spirituality shapes human relations with others	Relational dimension
4	Swinton (2001)	Spirituality and humanity	Spirituality emphasizes presence for others	Strengthening the ethics of Liyan
5	Principe (1983)	The essence of spirituality	Spirituality as a transformative life experience	Conceptual basis

Based on the table, it is clear that spirituality plays a crucial role in rebuilding the ethical dimension of humanity. Cimperman emphasizes that solidarity is a concrete form of moral responsibility that is not only individual but also social[18]. This aligns with the Spirituality of the Noble Blood, which places solidarity at the core of human life. Schneiders points out that spirituality is not merely related to religious practice, but is a process of life transformation that leads to openness to others[19]. In this context, spirituality becomes a means to build a deeper ethical awareness. Waaijman adds that spirituality has a strong relational dimension, where relationships with others are an integral part of the spiritual experience itself[1].

Furthermore, Swinton emphasizes that spirituality demands a concrete presence for others, especially those experiencing suffering[20]. This demonstrates that spirituality is not abstract, but rather concrete in action. Principe also emphasizes that spirituality is a transformative life experience, capable of changing the way humans

[18] Schneiders, Sandra M. "Religion vs. Spirituality: A Contemporary Conundrum." *Spiritus* 3, no. 2 (2003): 163–185.

[19] Waaijman, Kees. "Spirituality: Forms, Foundations, Methods." *Studies in Spirituality* 16 (2006): 1–18.

[20] Swinton, John. "Spirituality and Mental Health Care." *Journal of Clinical Nursing* 10, no. 6 (2001): 760–766.

view themselves and others[21]. Thus, the Spirituality of the Precious Blood can be understood as an ethical-transformative path capable of addressing the humanitarian crisis in fluid modernity. This spirituality offers not only theoretical reflection, but also a concrete life practice, in which humans are called to live out moral responsibility radically. Human integrity, in this perspective, is not found in structural certainty, but rather in the courage to love, sacrifice, and be present for others. In the context of modernity full of uncertainty, this approach becomes highly relevant because it can restore humans to their essential humanity. The Spirituality of the Precious Blood is not only an alternative but also a critique of social systems that tend to ignore human values. Thus, this spirituality opens up the possibility of creating a more dignified and humane life together.

CONCLUSION

This research shows that fluid modernity, characterized by uncertainty, individualization, and social exclusion, has resulted in a profound humanitarian crisis. Under these conditions, humans no longer have a solid foundation for determining their identity and the meaning of life. Increasingly shallow social relations and the dominance of instrumental logic have weakened moral responsibility toward others, putting humans at risk of dehumanization and losing their sense of self. Through an analysis of Zygmunt Bauman's thinking, it is discovered that the concept of human wholeness can no longer be understood as adherence to external norms or rules. Instead, human wholeness lies in the individual's ability to take personal moral responsibility toward the "Other." Thus, ethics is no longer merely normative, but becomes a life practice rooted in relationships with others.

In this context, the Spirituality of the Precious Blood presents itself as an ethical-transformative path capable of addressing the humanitarian crisis in fluid modernity. This spirituality affirms that human wholeness is found in the courage to love, sacrifice, and build boundless solidarity. These values serve as the foundation for more humane and dignified relationships, while also serving as a critique of social systems that tend to ignore the ethical dimension of life. Thus, it can be concluded that being fully human in a fluid age is not about achieving certainty or stability, but rather about a willingness to continue to shoulder moral responsibility amidst uncertainty. Human wholeness lies in a commitment to maintaining hope for a more just and dignified life together. Therefore, the integration of sociological and spiritual perspectives is crucial in an effort to restore humans to their essential humanity, namely as beings responsible for others.

[21] Principe, Walter H. "Toward Defining Spirituality." *Studies in Religion* 12, no. 2 (1983): 127–141.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Barnett, Ronald. "Learning for an Unknown Future." Higher Education Research & Development 23, no. 3 (2004): 247–260.

Bauman, Zygmunt. "Postmodern Ethics." Theory, Culture & Society 10, no. 1 (1993): 1–18.

Bauman, Zygmunt. "The Individualized Society and Its Discontents." Thesis Eleven 54, no. 1 (1998): 1–9.

Bauman, Zygmunt. Liquid Modernity. Cambridge: Polity Press, 2000.

Bauman, Zygmunt. Wasted Lives: Modernity and Its Outcasts. Cambridge: Polity Press, 2004.

Beck, Ulrich. "Living in the World Risk Society." Economy and Society 35, no. 3 (2006): 329–345.

Biesta, Gert. "Good Education in an Age of Measurement." Educational Assessment, Evaluation and Accountability 21, no. 1 (2010): 33–46.

Cimperman, Maria. "The Spirituality of Solidarity." Theological Studies 74, no. 2 (2013): 280–303.

Delanty, Gerard. "Modernity and Postmodernity: Knowledge, Power and the Self." European Journal of Social Theory 3, no. 2 (2000): 1–15.

Fox, Nick J. "Postmodernism, Sociology and Health." Sociology of Health & Illness 18, no. 3 (1996): 387–404.

Giddens, Anthony. "Modernity and Self-Identity." Stanford University Press Journal Review (1991).

Levinas, Emmanuel. "Ethics as First Philosophy." Dalam The Levinas Reader. Oxford: Blackwell, 1989.

Merriam, Sharan B. "Qualitative Research: A Guide to Design and Implementation." Adult Education Quarterly 62, no. 1 (2012): 93–95.

Noddings, Nel. "An Ethic of Care and Its Implications." American Journal of Education 96, no. 2 (1988): 215–230.

Principe, Walter H. "Toward Defining Spirituality." Studies in Religion 12, no. 2 (1983): 127–141.

Schneiders, Sandra M. "Religion vs. Spirituality: A Contemporary Conundrum." Spiritus 3, no. 2 (2003): 163–185.

Scribano, Adrian. "Sociology of Bodies/Emotions and Liquid Modernity." Current Sociology 61, no. 5–6 (2013): 1–10.

Swinton, John. "Spirituality and Mental Health Care." Journal of Clinical Nursing 10, no. 6 (2001): 760–766.

Taylor, Charles. "The Ethics of Authenticity." Harvard University Press Review (1991).

Waaijman, Kees. "Spirituality: Forms, Foundations, Methods." Studies in Spirituality 16 (2006): 1–18.